Translatability of Religious Intertextuality in Literary Texts

Maan M. Aubed Ph.D
Department of Translation, College of Arts, Tikrit
University, Tikrit, Iraq

قابلية ترجمة النصوص الدينية في النصوص الأدبية

الدكتور
معن محمد عبيد
جامعة تكريت - كلية الآداب - قسم الترجمة
maubed1@gmail.com
Abstract: This paper aims at investigating the difficulties faced in translating religious intertexts in the novel of Midaq Alley by the Egyptian novelist Naguib Mahfouz [1], seeking to explore the challenges and difficulties that affected both the translator and the target-text readership of this novel. Such difficulties result from the different attitudes of both Arabic and English cultures towards religious practices. It shows how such differences affected the target text and how the translator copes with them during the translation process. It hopes that research highlights how cultural losses continue to occur even when the target text does not suffer any linguistic loss. Such losses are on the symbolic and deep level where the translator should read between the lines to capture the cultural implications meant by the source-text producer.

Keywords: Intertextuality, translatability, religious intertexts, literary translation
I. Introduction

The term ‘intertextuality’ has been used and transformed many times since its coinage by Julia Kristeva in 1966. de Beaugrand and Dressler [2] see ‘Intertextuality’ is one of the aspects of textuality. According to them, it subsumes “the ways in which the production and reception of a given text depend upon the participants’ knowledge of other texts”.

It was not Mikhail Bakhtin [3] who created the term intertextuality in The Dialogic Imagination, nevertheless this work that paved the way to intertextuality, adopted by many scholars. When Bakhtin used the term “dialogic” in this research, it was proposed that discourse can be produced in a cultural circumstance, which can be obtained through the experience in a language, the group of rules of an interaction have internalized by both sides through belonging to the specific speech community. Bakhtin in his dialogic context, contends that a prose is a complex form of literary elements, and no word can be neutral in a prose, every discourse is produced as a response to the previous discourses in the particular text. Bakhtin [3] also argues that a novel is written as a reaction to previous literary works and it paves the way for further future novels as reaction to itself as in the case of discourse interaction within prose. Thus, it would be logical to conclude from Bakhtin’s ‘dialogic’ that there is literary work with a special uniqueness in its own unique cultural context; the only uniqueness lies in the discourse and amalgamation of words in the novel by its creator, as argued by Bakhtin [3]. As evidence to ‘dialogic’, Bakhtin [4] makes reference to the French writer Rabelais, arguing that parodies were popular in the 16th century and the parodies of sacred books and social events were reflected in Rabelais’ work. Moreover, as another proof to ‘dialogic’, Bakhtin [5] argues that Dostoyevsky’s works were directly related to Menippea developing from Antique Christian literature and that Dostoyevsky could have been influenced by other literary works in his novels. As for Kristeva [6], she states that every single word or a phrase in a text/work was already existent in already existent texts and those texts pave the way to new works/texts, transforming that new text into a mixture of references.

In the same way, Fairclough [7] defines intertextuality as follows “Intertextuality is basically the property texts have of being full of snatches of other texts, which may be explicitly demarcated or merged in, and which the text may assimilate, contradict, ironically echo, and so forth”. According to Hatim and Mason [8] intertextuality is “... A
Translatability of Religious ................................. (766)

precondition for the intelligibility of texts, involving the dependence of one text upon another”. The intertextualities may appear at diverse levels: words, phrases, clauses, clause sequence, genres and discourses. They confirm that a very significant feature of the intertextual references is “... that they are all tangible elements in a text. They do not constitute the intertextual reference as such, but are crucial pointers to it ...” [8]

In the same vein, Barthes is another scholar who advocates reader-oriented approach [9], he argues that if a writer narrates everything in his/her text, then the analysis latent of that text is vanished, nonetheless it is the text readers who make it significant as a result of continuous re-creating of the text while reading it. Barthes [9], in his approach, argues that a text is composed of words coming together in a meaningful way, as well as it has many cultural elements. Thus, since a text has diverse social and cultural elements, a reader may bring his own cultural and social experiences of those elements while interpreting a definite text. It is sure that assimilation of social and cultural parts into a text contributes to its multilayered structure and surely produces intertextuality. One can notice that this approach is similar to those of Bakhtin’s and Kristeva’s.

Riffaterre also advocates a reader-oriented approach in text analysis. He [10] contends that intertextual elements in a text could only be activated if the reader is able to comprehend them. According to him [10], a producer of a text should purposely allow the readers to decode the intertextual references. He [11] brought into the existence the term ‘hypogram’ referring to a central thought in a text, upon which the whole text is produced. According to him [11], this ‘hypogram’ can be a word, a sentence, an idea or a cliché adopted from an already existing text. This confirms the fact that Riffaterre believes that it is impossible that a text exists on its own, but rather it is a reaction towards another work or from the way of life it was produced in, a fact which was already pinpointed by Bakhtin and Kristeva. Riffaterre [10] adds that “An intertext is one or more texts which the reader must know in order to understand a work of literature in terms of its overall significance (as opposed to the discrete meanings of its successive words, phrases, and sentences)”.

As for Don Fowler, he emphasized that “intertextuality is a property of language - and of semiotic systems in general – not simply of literature” [12], and he considers it as mainly a creation of active reading:

Intertextuality, like all aspects of literary reception, is ultimately located in reading practice, not in a textual system: meaning is realized at
the point of reception, and what counts as an intertext and what one does with it depends on the reader. [12]

The concept of intertextuality has also been applied to some Arabic literary studies. Asma Abu Bakr Ahmad, for instance, has investigated the employment of intertextuality as a significant means for studying modern Arabic poetry, she defines it as ‘التدخل بين النصوص’ ‘intertextuality’ [13]. She subdivides it into separate dimensions such as historical, literary and religious, as an instance of how a modern poet can employ religious texts to develop and enrich his works and invest it with multiple references ‘متعدد الدلالات’.

II. Importance and Purpose of Intertextuality

Intertexts are employed to attain some definite goals by texts’ writers. According to these goals, the text writer makes some changes on the intertextual references. In this vein, Morgan [14] confirms that Kristeva’s most essential contribution to ‘intertextuality’ lies in “… the idea that an intertextual citation is never innocent or direct, but always transformed, distorted, displaced, condensed, or edited in some way in order to suit the speaking subject's value system”. Morgan [14] sees that Intertextuality is meant to be a source of having a unique effect on the text receiver such as ambiguity, humour, nonsense, obscurity, etc.

Employment of Intertextuality shows to what extent an author is influenced by his culture and vice versa. When one produces a work of art, s/he is inevitably influenced by everything that s/he has seen or read up to that point. In the same way, authors of different cultural backgrounds and in different historical periods can influence each other. Intertextuality illustrates how a specific cultural, religious, political, or moral ideology can be formulated and articulated in different ways through different cultural practices. Literary writers have always been inspired by religious texts, attributing an extra value to their works. In this vein, Neubert and Shreve confirm that Intertextuality “may be the most important aspect of textuality for the translator” [15].

The extensive use of references to Islamic cultures is a prominent feature of Arabic literary works. As they produce their works, most Arab writers may not be able to free themselves from being influenced by Islam. Thus, they adopt the Qur’anic style along with incorporating expressions of religious associations to achieve a lofty style. Therefore, such style in association with other religious references poses a challenge for both the translators and the target-text readers.

III. Types of Intertextuality

Translatability of Religious ……………………………………… (767)
Before addressing the challenges, difficulties and problems that intertextuality poses for translators, one needs to shed light on its types. Hatim [16] uses the terms ‘horizontal’ and ‘vertical’, whilst also acknowledging Norman Fairclough’s [17] essentially similar distinction between ‘manifest’ and ‘constitutive’ categories of intertextuality. However, Hatim and Munday [18] clarify the ‘horizontal / vertical’ difference somewhat in a different way. For them, the ‘horizontal’ category of intertextuality includes ‘concrete reference to, or straight quotation from, other texts ... ’; the ‘vertical’ manifestation involves references and echoes of a genre with which text readers may be familiar, along with its associated type of discourse. As for Farahzad [19], she does not acknowledge the previous categorizations, however; she simply presents her own classification. In naming her classification, she seems to be influenced by terms familiar in translation studies, such as ‘overt’ where the intertext has direct citations and quotations from other intertexts; and ‘covert’, where the intertext links to and depends on other intertexts with regards to genre and discourse. However, she argues that there is no real dichotomy in process here, justifying that intertextual signs and references tend to be direct and indirect concurrently [19].

Quotation is a familiar tool adopted in the production of, for instance, various academic, journalistic, literary, and political texts. It is a type of borrowing that can be employed to create a text and set it within a defined discourse, to make it more appealing, or to bring about images pertinent and helpful of the text writer’s intentions and to gain an appropriate response from the readership. It is not easy to define an obvious separating line between allusion and quotation. The earlier is a common characteristic of written and spoken discourses, creating a type of ‘echo’ result, and more willingly clear to those of the culture in which the source of the allusion is located. Ritva Leppihalme [20] has illustrated in her study of the translation and interpretation of allusions how, even in the fairly short cultural remoteness separating Finnish readers from writers in Anglo-American culture, allusions of source-text can be a true ‘culture bump’ -a difficulty to translators, as well as to the target-text readers.

IV. Research Methodology
1. Data collection
In this study, the novel Midaq Alley by Naguib Mahfouz, originally published in 1947 is analyzed. The novel gives an account of events experienced and remembered in the local Egyptian neighborhood. As
another data collection tool, the English translation of the novel by Trevor Le Gassick [21] is analyzed for the evaluation of translation of intertextual references. Riffaterre’s [11] theory of intertextual references is adopted as the basis in data collection. The intertextual references are defined and their existence in other texts was located so that the interpretation of the allusions, signs and references in the novel can be based on solid grounds. Furthermore, the intertextual references in the source text and the target text were also analyzed to decide and highlight how these references were rendered into English.

2. Data analysis

The data gained through retroactive reading of the source text are analyzed qualitatively. The intertextual-religious references in the text are found in the relevant literature and the references are based on the source text they first used. Therefore, the references highlighted and the references that they initially existed in already existing texts and thought to have given motivation to the source-text writer in producing those references are reported. In reporting the results, the intertextual references are categorized as “ordinary intertextuality” or “obligatory intertextuality” based on Riffaterre’s theory. In the analysis English translations of the texts with intertexts are reported immediately after the Arabic excerpts so that the translation can be evaluated more clearly.

The Qur’an influences greatly Muslim societies, in particular the Arab ones, in terms of culture. The clothing, marriage, trade, customs, greetings, social forms of behaviours, etc are determined by Qur’an. This influence can be clearly seen in oral utterances and also in written texts. Sometimes, such an influence can be so extensive to the extent that some writers imitate and/or adopt the Qur’anic style and incorporate religious references in their works, as in Midaq Alley, for instance. Other Arabic writers adopt Qur’anic references in their writings aiming at maintaining a strong relationship between Arab readers and their own religion, providing them with eloquent expressions and the wordings of religious associations. Here are some examples, which illustrate that:

 وإذا اخترت الوفد، لم تأمن رئيس وزراء كصدقى باشا يعمل جوارك هشيما تذروه الرياح 
[1]

If you choose the Wafed, a Prime Minister like Sadiq Pasha will destroy your business and scatter it to the wind. [21]

Examining the above target text, one can tell that the translator was successful in preserving the foreignness of the source text. He rendered
the image literally, an image uncommon in English. But the literal rendering has brought about a loss in the religious-based idiom of the source text. In the Arabic text, the character refers to his father’s trade should he join the Wafed party, simply using a verse from the Qur’an. He compares the complete destruction that may befall his father’s trade to the throwing of dry ash into the wind. Although the meaning of the source text is attained by a literal rendering, the spirit of the original as echoed in the source language is lost, since the Arabic text is much more appealing. It seems quite difficult for the target audience to call up the cultural background necessary to realise that the character’s answer was a Qur’anic verse. However, the flavour of the Arabic culture can be noticed. Let us take another example:

[1]

They started a small party which would not end until the dawn gave enough light to distinguish “a black from a white thread” [21]

The above rendering illustrates the loss of the source-text implication, which has resulted from the literal translation. The original verse refers to a special night in Ramadan, the month of fasting, prayer and other religious rituals. Muslims show their religious commitment through spending this night praying, praising God and reciting their holy Qur’an. Mahfouz’s characters have a particular night, but it is entirely dissimilar from the one cited in the Qur’an. The writer is ironic about those who spend their night indulging in immoral behaviour. So the literal translation does not convey the ironic tone of the Arabic text. It is possible that the translator may not have captured the cultural significance of the speaker’s words. Another incorporation of a verse from the Qur’an in the source text is clear in the following example:

[1]

His eyes would turn white in loathing and rage. [21]

It is clear from this example that literal translation results in a loss of the religious-based idiom. The Arabic text explains the extreme sadness of the wife while watching her husband going out with his boyfriend. The author refers to a verse from the Holy Qur’an to explain such a state. Arabs usually use such verses to refer to an intense degree of sadness by saying, “his eyes became white with sorrow” [22]. Adding to that, such a collocation is unfamiliar in English, which results in an unusual target rendering.
In Midaq Alley, there are also intertextual references relating to Islamic history and important events that took place after the Prophet’s (Mohammad) death, which led to the division of Muslims into two groups: Sunnis and Shiites. Shiism became particularly consolidated with the martyrdom of Al-Husain Ibn Ali, who was killed in the seventh century, along with most of the members of his family by the army of the Umayyad caliph Yazid in Karbala in Iraq [23]. The martyrdom of Al-Hussain is celebrated by the Shiites (his sect) every year during the first ten days of the Muharram¹. Shiites believe that those who insulted and killed Al-Hussain were punished and visited by some immediate or future misfortune.

Al-Hussain is the grandson of the Prophet Mohammad, whose family is usually referred to as ‘the People of the House’. A short history of ‘the people of the house’ is helpful to highlight the cultural and historical background of the extensive use of this reference in the novel and how such a concept may not be comprehended in full by the target reader. The people of the House or saints have become well known for their Barakat (blessings), for their supernatural power and for their miracles. Their tombs were and are still visited by people seeking their blessings or requesting their Shaffaa ‘intercession’ in the time of need, sadness or pain (cf. Weiss & Green) [24]. Among those who can intercede are angels, the prophet and the true believers, and the relatives of the prophet, like Lady Zainab, Al-Hassan and Al-Hussain, as referred to in the novel. In Midaq Alley it is clear in the conversation between the characters, referring constantly to ‘the People of the House’, and their piety:

آه تغير كل شيء. أجل كل شيء يا ستي! كل شيء تغير إلا قلبي فهو يحب آل البيت

العامر, [1]

Yes, everything has changed. Yes, indeed, everything has changed, my lady! Everything has changed except my heart and it still loves the people of the House. [21]

The literal translation of the Islamic terminology results in a loss of the religious association as well as historical events as hinted at in the source text. The Arabic reader is familiar with such an expression as ‘my lady’ whom is addressed in this sentence as well as the ‘People of the House’. But the literal translation brought about an unintelligible target rendering. Therefore, the historical and religious importance of the source text is lost in the target text.
In another excerpt, the translator adds an explanation, but such an addition is not related to the context. This addition results in the difficulty of realizing the importance of the religious allusion by the target reader:

You are raving, woman, raving by the life of the Prophet’s grandson Hussain! May God recompense him for his cruel murder. [21]

Trevor Le Gassick successfully adds a definition to the name of Al-Hussain, as ‘the prophet’s grandson’ and another guiding expression like “May God recompense him for his cruel murder”. But even after including an addition, there is still a loss of historical events referred to by the cruel murder in which the target reader will face another difficulty in recognizing what the cruel murder is.

Another member of the house is referred to as “My lady”. In a dialogue between Shaikh Darwish and Mr. Kirsha, the former being surprised that Mr. Kirsha prefers males while his wife has such masculinity that many men lack. Sheikh Darwish keeps on explaining about such an old evil as:

It is not true love. True love is only for the descendants of Muhammad. Come, my Lady Zainab, granddaughter of the prophet… come, Madam… I am weak. O mother of the weak ones. [21]

The translation sounds communicatively acceptable because the translator explains that Zainab is ‘the granddaughter of the prophet’. However, the historical implication of the source text is still lost. Phrases like ‘Lady Zainab’ and ‘descendent of Muhammad’ and their religious implications may not be easy to grasp in full by the target reader, unless there are notes or information to guide him/her. There is another reference to the Al-Hussain Mosque and its importance in the life of the people of the Alley. The mosque was visited and still is by many people seeking intercession. In the novel, Abbas tells Hamida that he will travel to earn money in order to marry her and to start a better life for both of them. She replies:

She replies:

Sأدعو لك بالتوافق، وسأزور سيدنا الحسين و أسأله أن يرعاك ويكبلك للنجاح. [1]
I will pray for your success and will visit the tomb of our Lord Hussain and ask him to watch over you and bring you success. [21]

This example explains the social practice based on the religious belief of some Arab societies, especially of the Shiites, in visiting such places, seeking intercession. Despite the fact that the target text is linguistically appropriate, there is still a loss of the social practice of a religious dimension, which results from the literal rendering of the phrase “visit the tomb of our Lord Hussain”. To visit and request some religious saints, even after their death and seek their intercession is one of the features of the people of the Alley, but it is alien to the target readers. Out of these examples, it is clear that an allusion related to some historical or religious background is one of the many complexities that faced both the translator and the future target readers. Such expressions lead to some losses on the part of the target-text readership because they are specific items of the source text. To solve such a difficulty, a translator should either provide an endnote or footnote, or he can resort to a glossary explaining these expressions in order to make them more understandable in the target text.

As far as religious issues are concerned, one pillar is mentioned in the novel that is Hajj, the pilgrimage to Mecca, which is the last pillar of Islam. All mature Muslims with the right intentions, sufficient financial resources, and physically and mentally healthy are required to perform this task at least once during their lifetime. Collectively, pilgrims confirm the basic tenets of Islam, including the assertion of God’s oneness, compliance to God, and the necessity for a global Muslim community. In his autobiography Malcolm X stated that “The brotherhood! The people of all races, colours, from all over the world coming together as one! It has proven to me the power of the One God” [24]. In some societies, the Hajj transforms ordinary individuals into extraordinary pious exemplars, or social elites. Muslims believe that he, who performs the pilgrimage for God’s sake and neither looks loosely nor acts wickedly, shall return as pure without any sins as he was born. The rewards of pilgrimage are paradise. When you see a pilgrim, salute, embrace him, and request him to ask pardon of God for you [25].

The target reader should have some background knowledge to understand the concept of Hajj so that they might comprehend the speech of Redwan Hussainy to his people of the Alley before his pilgrimage to Mecca:
Hussainy had hoped God would choose him to make the Holy pilgrimage to Mecca and Medina this year, and so He had. [21]

The above translation has basically been acceptable, but there is still a loss of the source-text religious practice and association. In the Arabic text, the writer refers to Salat al-istikharah (the guidance prayer) using the expression “had hoped God would choose him”, but in the target text, there is no reference to this prayer. The al-Istikharah Salat is a particular prayer a Muslim performs to ask God’s help and guidance to make a decision or to choose between two alternatives. This prayer should be performed with a good faith and with full trust that God is able to help, and that He is the only guider for a person to the right path. A person cannot perform al-Istikharah Salat to ask God’s help for doing evil or bad act. For a Muslim believer, after performing al-Istikharah Salat, a person gets a strong feeling toward one option; this is usually the right one (cf. Saleh) [26]. Furthermore, in the above translation, the translator renders the word Hajj using its equivalent in the target text. It would have been better if the translator had transliterated the term along with a guideline in the form of endnotes because a pilgrimage is not equivalent to Hajj. A retention would have been a good solution for the Islamic terms, along with either footnotes or a glossary at the end to make them comprehensible to the target-text readers.

Another long speech by Hussainy about the importance of holy places like Mecca, wishing to spend the rest of his life there:

There [in Mecca] are the remedy and the cure. Oh my brother, I long for Mecca and its bright heavens. I long to hear the whispering of time at the very corner … I long to drink from the well of Zamzam and take the road of the Messenger on his Flight, followed by the multitudes of thirteen hundred years ago and those of today, too. I long to feel my heart grow chill when I visit the grave of the Prophet and pray in the Holy Garden. [21]
Although the translator delivers the communicative message of the source text, a loss of religious and historical associations is still clear in the target text by referring to these places as the remedy and the cure of psychological sickness which may not be accepted by the target reader. The historical association of the well of Zamzam is familiar to the Arabs because of its historical importance among the Muslim communities. Thus, the source and the target readers will have different attitudes with reference to the Islamic rituals and the importance of the well of Zamzam. Therefore, a literal rendering is not sufficient to produce the same effect as that of the original. Hence, in such cases, introductory notes to the translation, footnotes, additions within the text are some of the methods, which might be helpful. The writer continued to explain what Hajj is and how many times every Muslim has to perform Hajj, at least once in the lifetime:

The pilgrimage is a duty for all who can make it. One should perform it for oneself and for all those who cannot go … Oh Redwan Hussainy, remember me when you are in the ritual dress. [21]

The translator came across a specific term related to Islamic rituals. The term (إحرام) ‘ihram’ has no lexical equivalent in the target language; therefore he resorted to paraphrasing the term as “when you are in the ritual dress”. By paraphrasing, the translator transferred the meaning of the source text, but unfortunately lost its religious association. Hence, religious expressions reflect various aspects of human experience as an extremely important part of the source culture, but when translated into English, the religious associations as well as religious-based practices present in the original text are lost. Thus, such losses show how challenging a religious and cultural intertextual references is in translation.

V. Conclusion

Intertextuality is a culture-bound element, and its comprehensibility varies greatly across the cultural and linguistic barriers. Various procedures adopted by the translator in rendering intertexts seem to play a crucial role in the recognition and perception of connotations associated with them. If the translator tackles a literary work without paying appropriate attention to these references, there is a big chance that the connotations not to be conveyed as a result of his/her failure to recognize
them. Thus, they will be completely lost and vanished to the most target-
text readers. Consequently, the product i.e. the translation will be futile.
As intertextual references are culture-bound, they form potential
translation challenge. In order to activate the associations and
connotations accompanying those references in the source text for the
target-text readership, a translator may add some explanatory information
to his/her renderings. It could be said that the most important principle
for a translator of such source text is to leave as many intertextual
expressions as possible open for the recipient’s own interpretation.
However, it could be difficult for the English target-text readers to fully
understand these references as the English culture is quite distant from
the Arabic one. That is, each source text includes intertexts, many of
which are probably unfamiliar to contemporary Arabic readers and
difficult, if not impossible; to track down by the means the readers have
at their disposal.

One can notice that the influence of the Qur’an on Mahfouz’s
language can be touched in many provided examples of religious
expressions of the Qur’anic style. Translating such expressions into
English poses different challenges, leading to loss in the target text. The
above examples reveal that the literal translation successfully delivers the
communicative message of the source text, yet it disregards the religious
implications present. Such losses may result in the target reader not fully
comprehending the issue, at the same time reflecting the difficulties
translators face when rendering expressions related to Qur’anic Verses.
The frequent use of terms and expressions of religious meanings points to
the strong relationship between the Qur’an and Islamic culture. Although
both religions: Christianity and Islam have much in common, the
translator faces difficulty to locate equivalents between the range of
aspects of both religions.

Some translators think translation together with footnotes
unattractive; however use of footnotes assists the target-text readers to
have a clear image of the source-text contents. The word ‘Notes’ can have
a more power for transferring the concepts. Furthermore, employing
footnotes in the translation, seems to be crucial so that the foreign-
language readers benefits from the text to the same extent of the source-
text readers do. The translator’s skills are needed by both the source-text
author and the target-text recipients to activate intertextuality and thus to
give the text the opportunity to survive. At the same time, the translator
should be attentive not to deprecate the target-text readers’ intellectual
Translatability of Religious ………………………………… (777)
capabilities because an intertextual reference is usually meant to transfer its meaning through connotation. Thus, translators have to enjoy a profound knowledge of what is being referred to in the source text in order to comprehend the relations between them and understand the writer’s own intention behind using such allusive references. Intertextuality is essential to the creation of literary works and reception of translations. However, the possibility of achieving perfect and precise translation of foreign intertexts is virtually nonexistent. As a result, intertexts are usually replaced by analogous but ultimately different intertextual relations with the target language.

References
[27]. (https://www.britannica.com)

1 The term ‘Muarram’ is used to refers to the first month of the Islamic calendar.
2 Iram is a term used to refer to a sacred state into which a Muslim must enjoy to perform pilgrimage. It has special rituals. During the period of sanctification, sexual activity, shaving, and cutting one’s nails all are forbidden during the Ihram [27].